

Citizens Advisory Council General Assembly Meeting
August 28, 2019 meeting minutes

1. Attendees: Daniella Alcedo, Greg Anderson, Tammy Ashton, James Askew, Tony Banash, Brian Bowens, Michael Conrad, Russ Davies, Hank Fung, Anna Martin, Keith Martin, Penny Meyer, Anne Reid, Wally Shidler, Bob Wolfe

2. Approve minutes: motion Banash, second Meyer, carried unanimously

3. LIFE Program Update – Juan Miranda

- No longer doing coupons, now loading directly onto the card. Does not work at Metro vending machines but at physical vendors or on the web site. Show up to an administrator with ID, TAP card, and proof of income. Discount is deducted on the spot. You can switch between options per month. Annual enrollment – 12 full months after enrollment is approved. The agencies who enroll do the eligibility verification.
- Questions from CAC members:
 - How is the outreach to communities, including social service providers? The enrollment agencies do their own outreach to the communities they serve, and Metro is also doing system advertising on buses and rail, and soon to the general public.
 - How are eligibility for persons verified? Through tax returns, social security award letters, etc.
 - How many participate? Very few regular riders are participating. Approximately 45,000 people are participating, but that is less than 15% of the regular ridership when it is known a larger percentage is low income.
 - TAP on the cell phone – this is on the TAP side and is not part of LIFE.
 - How was the income level determined? This is at the HUD very low income standard. Questioner does not feel it is equitable to be so low.
 - Is there a different income for disabled? No, the income level is the same. \$36,550 for a one person household. Proof of EBT, social security disability, etc. also works.
- LIFE limited rides for one time situations like homelessness, domestic violence, release of indigent people, etc. Four ride regional pass, replacing tokens, with a TAP chip.
- Public comment:
 - Louis Burns, Access Services – transition to TAP card to cell phones. Staff clarified they do not handle TAP program, only the subsidy.
 - Arnold Sachs – Saw the program mentioned in the downstairs. Has food stamp and TAP card, tried to apply at Metro offices but can't. Not sure about what TAP is doing about validators since many of them don't work. The LIFE program is difficult to access because they can't apply at Metro offices.

4. Discuss and select CAC standing committee chairs, and outside groups for speakers to discuss the key topic for the CAC.

- Vice Chair would like to hear from LA Walks
- Anne Reid placed three organizations on a list of potential contacts.
- Bob Wolfe - UCLA – someone studying link between transportation and sustainability – Ethan Elkind. Or someone from USC.
- Chair wants to create a one way email distribution of links to articles, videos, podcasts, etc. related to transportation. Discussed the Harvard study related to upward mobility and how

transportation relates to it and the link is phenomenal – the impact of better public transportation to improving future generations lives. Also the New York Times article about transportation and housing, and commute times – time spent in transportation is a better indicator of future poverty than things like family income. Riding the buses article from LA Times.

- Bob Wolfe – Wall Street Journal article about transportation.
- Hank Fung – Staff will share the article to the members.
- Nominees for Standing Committees: Construction – Malcolm Harris, Operations – Darrell Clarke, Planning/Programming – David Lara
- Some discussion on what the standing committees will do and who has shown interest.
- Moved by Fung to elect the nominees of the standing committee and thus have them serve on the executive committee. Malcolm Harris for standing committee on Construction, David Lara for standing committee of planning/programming, Darrell Clarke for standing committee of operations. Second by Banash, carried unanimously.

5. Focus item on FY 2019-20 report to Board

- Congestion pricing
 - Chair - Harvard report on congestion pricing – it touches on all aspects that Metro plans and operates for. Safety, service and operations, housing, bicycling, etc. Would like to provide a recommendation on congestion pricing, because it will touch the lives of everyone in the county. It is currently one of the long term focuses of the CEO and Metro board and so we can contribute a lot. It has become a national conversation.
 - Bob Wolfe – the Silver Line. Very unique aspects that no one dives in seriously. The ridership is very high and it covers a lot of Metro geography. It is an example of congestion pricing. Focusing on it as a case study since it is subsidized by toll money. Silver Line is not mentioned in the long range plan. Also, the Silver Line has higher pricing than the other lines, so how much does fare structure affect ridership? Chair agrees that you could look at Silver Line as an example on the regional connectivity. The ridership would be the benefit of congestion pricing on drivers and would be the fiscal offset.
 - Tony Banash – are we producing multiple work products? Chair – we would be producing them consecutively.
 - Anne Reid – if we focus on congestion pricing, will it to be the exclusion of other topics? Chair - There will still be some mandatory topics like ethics and Title VI. Chair says that this topic is so large that many topics have a nexus to it. For example, there is connectivity between LIFE and congestion pricing. Anne is concerned about tackling this to the exclusion of other topics. Anne also is asking what we can provide vs. Metro staff analysis. Chair says that CAC could bring our life experience and the input of other groups in the community, use the broad based experience to provide advice regarding the topic. We would vote on items up and down statements to include in a concise, consistent way.
 - Russ Davies – How many boardings on the Orange Line compared to the other lines? Chair - This may be a question that could come as part of congestion pricing.
 - Bob Wolfe – it may be difficult to come to consensus. For example, contrasting sustainability and equity – they may be conflicting goals.

- Chair – the reason to become chair is to provide the citizens’ opinions to Metro and the board of directors. The goal is to provide something to the Metro board, not just ask questions here. There has to be a product to communicate.
- Vice Chair – We are all here because we bring broad knowledge to the table. It could be sustainability, it could be equity, get ideas from the community. Congestion pricing could be discussed for some time. Other people have an issue of safety.
- Chair – the mandate is to give advice on wide Metro policies and programs.
- Anne Reid – talk about pricing generally, congestion pricing is too specific. For example, we talked about the LIFE program and equity. Maybe we can schedule our meetings to have a focus on pricing.
- Motion to close discussion: for the purpose of producing a final report this year for the Metro board, and not to the exclusion of information gathering on other topics that this council normally does, can we focus on congestion pricing for the specific topic to the Metro board for FY 2019-20? Move by Bowers, second Banash. 6 for-5 against -2 abstain.

Public comment:

- Arnold Sachs – LA drivers tired of sitting in mind numbing driving article in the news was discussed. Turning the 105 into a toll road, the Silver Line is paid for by HOV lanes but he does not think it is congestion pricing. London has congestion pricing during certain times of day, is that something to consider? It’s not about a freeway line or bus line, but the entire area. Systems – is the LADOT transit lines a system of congestion pricing? Ridden a lot of lines, and Metro has had a loss of 30% of ridership on some of them.

6. Administrative items

Metro Title VI presentation and ethics presentation in September.

CAC Executive Committee meeting Time change:

- Moving to 10 am will provide better ability for individuals to participate in executive committee, because it allows for people to have the meeting and get on with the rest of the day.
- Change will be effective October meeting. September meeting will stay at 11:30 am.

8. Items not on the agenda

- Vice Chair – West Santa Ana Branch event with Janice Hahn. Metro meeting on West Santa Ana Branch September 9 in Paramount. Posted on the web site.

Prepared by Hank Fung, CAC secretary